

## Reviewer's report

**Title:** Complex proximal femoral fractures in the elderly managed by reconstruction nailing - complications and outcomes.

**Version: 1 Date:** 21 May 2007

**Reviewer:** Minos Tyllianakis

### Reviewer's report:

General

Though the material used in the study has been surpassed by others, the article remains interesting.

-----  
Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

None

-----  
Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

None

-----  
Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

1. The long mean operative duration (132 min) is sufficiently explained by the authors by the relative lack of experience of some surgeons.

2. What is shown in figures 2 and 3 is the "reverse Z-effect phenomenon" described by Boldin et al (Acta Orthop Scand 2003;74:53-58). The original "Z-effect phenomenon" has been described by others [Werner-Tutschku W et al (Unfallchirurg 2002;105:881-885) and Tyllianakis M et al (Acta Orthop Belg 2004; 70:444-454)].

I think that the authors might comment on that.

**What next?:** Accept after discretionary revisions

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.